











February 15, 2023

Via Email and Post Mail

Tae D. Johnson, ICE Deputy Director Tae.D.Johnson@ice.dhs.gov

Kerry Doyle, ICE Principal Legal Advisor Kerry.Doyle@ice.dhs.gov

Corey Price, Executive Associate Director, ICE Enforcement and Removal Operations Corey.A.Price@ice.dhs.gov

Scott Lanum, Assistant Director, ICE Office of Diversity and Civil Rights Scott.Lanum@ice.dhs.gov

Amy Cucinella, Policy Advisor, DHS Council on Combating Gender-Based Violence Amy.Cucinella@dhs.hq.gov

Re: Letter in Support of Non-Citizen Survivors + Witnesses of Staff Abuse at FCI Dublin

We write as over 120 organizations throughout California and the United States in support of noncitizen survivors and witnesses of staff abuse at the Federal Correctional Institute at Dublin (FCI Dublin). For years, employees at the federal women's prison in Dublin, California have sexually abused people in their custody, specifically targeting immigrant women. And for years, Immigration and Customs Enforcement (ICE) has knowingly detained and deported noncitizens who suffered heinous abuse at the hands of federal employees, and who risked retaliation to speak out against staff misconduct. Survivors of prison staff sexual abuse and retaliation should be allowed to return to their communities and heal from the trauma they've endured—not subjected to indefinite civil detention and permanent separation from their families. We write to demand that ICE release survivors and witnesses of staff sexual abuse at FCI Dublin from immigration detention, and safeguard them from deportation.

FCI Dublin has been the center of a sprawling criminal investigation, 1 multiple Congressional inquiries,² and national media attention.³ It is well-established that **employees across the** institution sexually abused dozens of people in their custody, and that prison staff engaged in egregious misconduct, including stalking, harassment, assault, and rape. It is also clear that staff specifically targeted noncitizen and non-English speaking women, who they knew were facing detention and deportation after release.4

Since June 2021, federal prosecutors have indicted five former FCI Dublin employees for sexually abusing people in their custody. 5 Court records show that almost all of these officials abused immigrant women, and federal investigators have relied on the testimony of dozens of noncitizen victims and witnesses. Last week, former FCI Dublin guard Enrique Chavez was sentenced to two years in prison for sexually abusing multiple incarcerated women; ICE has already deported at least one of Chavez's victims.⁶ In December 2022, a jury found former warden Ray Garcia guilty of sexually abusing three incarcerated women, including a woman who testified at trial that she was undocumented and facing deportation. In August 2022, former Chaplain James Highhouse was sentenced to seven years in prison for repeatedly raping an incarcerated woman who was a long time green card holder.8 Following her release from FCI Dublin, ICE detained and deported her, despite knowing that she had been sexually abused by the chaplain and had reported her abuse.

Unfortunately, staff sexual abuse at FCI Dublin goes far beyond the conduct described in these five criminal prosecutions. 9 Advocates have spoken with dozens of people who report that they were abused by over 20 FCI Dublin employees. BOP's own records show that 17 additional current and former FCI Dublin staff members were under investigation for sexual misconduct as of May 2022, and this number continues to grow-additional staff members were placed on leave in December 2022.10

¹ Los Angeles Times, Corrections officer is 5th person charged in growing sex abuse scandal at federal female prison (Mar. 24, 2022); USA Today, Famed federal women's prison under investigation as 5th worker charged with sexual abuse of inmates (Mar. 24, 2022).

² U.S. Senate Permanent Subcommittee on Investigations (PSI), <u>Sexual Abuse of Female Inmates in Federal Prisons</u> (Dec. 13, 2022); Grassley, Durbin, Padilla Meet With BOP Director To Further Investigate Sexual Misconduct (Feb. 1, 2023); Rep. Swalwell Joins Colleagues in Calling on Inspector General Horowitz and Director Carvajal to Investigate Abuses at FCI Dublin (Mar. 3, 2022).

3 Associated Press, Women's Prison Fostered Culture of Abuse (Feb. 6, 2022); Associated Press, Abhorrent': Prison

Boss Vexes DOJ with Alleged Intimidation (Mar. 4, 2022); Mother Jones, Ex-Warden of Federal "Rape Club" Prison Convicted of Sexual Abuse (Dec. 7, 2022); KTVU, Powerless in Prison: Surviving Sex Abuse (Sept. 23, 2022). ⁴ NPR, Advocates seek compassionate release for women sexually abused while incarcerated (Oct. 28, 2022); Associated Press, Abuse-clouded prison gets attention, but will things change? (May 4, 2022); Berkeley Journal of Gender, Law & Justice, Institutionalized indifference: FCI Dublin and the policies quietly stifling sexual misconduct complaints in federal prisons (Dec. 21, 2022).

5 KTVU, Dozens of women detail rape and retaliation at Dublin prison (Sept. 23, 2022).

⁶ U.S. Department of Justice, Former Correctional Officer Sentenced To 20 Months In Prison For Abusive Sexual Contact With Inmate (Feb. 9, 2023); Mercury News, Federal judge says no way to proposed sentences for Dublin prison

cook who sexually abused women, gives him more than prosecutors wanted (Feb. 9, 2023).

7 U.S. Department of Justice, Jury Convicts Former Federal Prison Warden for Sexual Abuse of Three Female Inmates (Dec. 8, 2022); Los Angeles Times, Former warden at female prison known as 'rape club' guilty of sexually abusing women behind bars (Dec. 8, 2022).

⁸ U.S. Department of Justice, Federal Prison Chaplain Sentenced for Sexual Assault and Lying to Federal Agents (Aug. 31, 2022); KTVU, Women say Dublin prison chaplain used Bible, God to manipulate them to have sex (Sept. 1, 2022). ⁹ San Francisco Chronicle, Advocates, employees say abuses at Dublin prison will continue without 'real changes' (Dec. 12, 2022).

¹⁰ KTVU, 3 FCI Dublin officers put on leave as warden's sex abuse trial got underway (Dec. 5, 2022); KTVU, More than a dozen Dublin prison officers reassigned in wake of sex scandal (May 18, 2022).

Survivors' stories make clear that these staff members consistently targeted immigrant women, and that ICE repeatedly detained and deported noncitizen survivors and witnesses. Advocates report that:

- ICE has already deported at least 7 women who were sexually assaulted by FCI
 Dublin staff. One of those women reports that a prison guard followed her to her birth
 country after she was deported, where he continued physically and sexually abusing her for
 over two years.
- At least 15 survivors and witnesses of staff sexual abuse at FCI Dublin are currently in deportation proceedings, including multiple women who assisted federal investigators and testified against prison officials in court.
- At least 6 FCI Dublin survivors and witnesses are currently detained indefinitely by ICE at the notorious Northwest Detention Center (NWDC) in Tacoma, Washington. Conditions at NWDC are deplorable; over 100 people recently staged a hunger strike over inhumane treatment, including substandard medical and mental healthcare.¹¹ Human rights groups report that people at NWDC have been subjected to sexual abuse, which ICE has failed to investigate.¹²
- At least 8 FCI Dublin survivors and witnesses who are still in BOP custody are the subject of immigration detainers, and face detention and deportation after their sentences are up. One incarcerated survivor who is just weeks away from her release date reports that ICE recently issued an immigration detainer in her case, despite knowing that she was repeatedly raped by a federal prison guard, who was convicted of sexually abusing her and other women in his custody.

This is unacceptable. ICE can and must release FCI Dublin survivors and witnesses from immigration detention and halt their deportations. The Department of Justice, ¹³ legal advocates, ¹⁴ and mental health experts ¹⁵ have recognized that continued incarceration is extremely harmful to survivors of prison sex abuse. The Deputy Assistant General recently recommended that federal agencies consider release, prosecutorial discretion, and immigration benefits for people abused by federal prison staff. ¹⁶ ICE's own policies also dictate that the agency must exercise discretion in cases involving noncitizen victims and witnesses of crime, and individuals who qualify for victim-based immigration relief. ¹⁷ ICE also has broad authority to decide who to detain and prosecute, regardless of their criminal records. ¹⁸

¹⁸ ICE, <u>Prosecutorial Discretion and the ICE Office of the Principal Legal Advisor</u> ("PD is the longstanding authority of a law enforcement agency, and an indispensable feature of any functioning legal system, that can be used to preserve

3

¹¹ University of Washington Human Rights Center, <u>Conditions at the Northwest Detention Center</u> (last updated Feb. 3, 2023); KUOW, <u>Hunger strike suspended at Tacoma ICE facility, but objections remain</u> (Feb 6, 2023).

¹² Seattle Times Editorial Board, <u>Sexual-abuse report underscores need to overhaul immigrant detention</u> (May 26, 2022); University of Washington Center for Human Rights, <u>Conditions at the NWDC: Reporting of Sexual Abuse and Assault</u> (May 16, 2022); Freedom for Immigrants, <u>Sexual Abuse, Assault, and Harassment in U.S. Immigration Detention Facilities</u> (April 11, 2017).

¹³ New York Times, <u>Justice Dept. Considers Early Release for Female Inmates Sexually Abused Behind Bars</u> (Dec. 13, 2022)

¹⁴ FAMM calls on DOJ to seek early release for women abused at federal prison in Dublin, California (May 10, 2022); Formerly Incarcerated People and Advocacy Organizations Urge Reform of US Bureau of Prisons (Sept. 6, 2022); Over 100 Advocacy Groups Demand Action from DOJ to End Rampant Sexual Abuse at FCI Dublin (Mar. 1, 2022).

 ¹⁵ Jennifer Hartsfield, Susan Sharp, and Sonya Conner, "<u>Cumulative Sexual Victimization and Mental Health Outcomes Among Incarcerated Women</u>" (2017), Dignity: A Journal of Analysis of Exploitation and Violence, Vol. 2: Iss. 1.
 ¹⁶ Office of the Deputy Attorney General, <u>Report and Recommendations Concerning the Department of Justice's</u>

Response to Sexual Misconduct by Employees of the Federal Bureau of Prisons (Nov. 2, 2022).

17 ICE Directive 11005.3, Using a Victim-Centered Approach with Noncitizen Crime Victims (Aug. 12, 2021).

ICE must take immediate action to ensure that no survivor or witness of sexual abuse by federal prison employees faces further incarceration and exile. We demand that ICE:

- immediately release survivors and witnesses of prison staff sexual abuse currently
 in immigration detention, and issue stays of removal to prevent their deportations
- exercise prosecutorial discretion in cases of survivors and witnesses of prison staff sexual abuse who are already in removal proceedings, and allow them to seek victimbased immigration relief
- moving forward, allow survivors and witnesses leaving FCI Dublin to return to their families and communities, and not subject them to detention or deportation.

Sincerely,

The Sentencing Project

ACLU Foundation of Northern California San Francisco, CA Al Otro Lado San Diego, CA Asian Americans Advancing Justice - Asian Law Caucus San Francisco, CA California Coalition for Women Prisoners Oakland, CA California Collaborative for Immigrant Justice Oakland, CA Center for Gender & Refugee Studies San Francisco, CA Oakland, CA Centro Legal de la Raza Civil Rights Education and Enforcement Center (CREEC) Denver, CO **Detention Watch Network** Washington, DC **Dolores Street Community Services** San Francisco, CA Ella Baker Center for Human Rights Oakland, CA Families Against Mandatory Minimums (FAMM) Washington, D.C. Freedom for Immigrants Oakland, CA Human Rights First Washington, D.C. Innovation Law Lab Oakland, CA Immigrant Legal Resource Center San Francisco, CA La Resistencia Tacoma, WA National Network for Immigrant and Refugee Rights Oakland, CA Northwest Immigrant Rights Project Seattle, WA Rights Behind Bars Washington, D.C. Survived & Punished Oakland, CA Tahirih Justice Center Falls Church, VA

A New PATH

Alianza Sacramento

Asian Prisoner Support Committee

ASISTA Immigration Assistance

San Diego, CA

Sacramento CA

Oakland, CA

Suffield, CT

limited government resources necessary to achieve just and fair outcomes in individual cases.") See also, e.g., Arizona v. US, 132 S. Ct. (2012); Reno v. Am.-Arab Anti-Discrimination Comm., 525 U.S. 471, 483 (1999).

Washington, D.C.

AVAN Immigration Services Bay Area United Against War Benedictine Sisters of Baltimore Berkeley Immigration Group

Brost Law Office

California Rural Legal Assistance (CLRA) Foundation Caminar Latino - Latinos United for Peace and Equity

CASA of Contra Costa County

Catholic Charities of the Diocese of Owensboro

Community Legal Services in East Palo Alto (CLSEPA)

Community Works

Counsel on American-Islamic Relations, California

Covote Rhode Island

Crisis Support Of Alameda County

CSA San Diego County

CURE California

Education and Leadership Foundation

El Concilio Family Services El/La Para TransLatinas

End Domestic Abuse Wisconsin End Solitary Santa Cruz County

Espacio Migrante Esperanza United Faithful Friends Families for Freedom

Family Violence Law Center

First Friends of New Jersev & New York

Food Empowerment Project

Freedom Archives Freedom Network USA Grassroots Leadership Hope Immigration

Illinois Alliance for Reentry & Justice

Illinois Coalition Against Domestic Violence

Immigrant Action Alliance

Immigrant Defenders Law Center Immigrant Defense Advocates

Immigration Counsel

Immigration Outreach Service Center

Immigrant Legal Defense

ISLA: Immigration Services and Legal Advocacy

Justice & Diversity Center, Bar Association of San Francisco

Kern Welcoming and Extending Solidarity to Immigrants

Latin Advocacy Network (LATINAN) La Raza Community Resource Center

Law Office of Heather Wolf

Los Angeles, CA

San Francisco, CA

Baltimore, MD

Berkeley, CA Cedar Falls, IA

Sacramento, CA

Atlanta. GA

Concord, CA

Owensboro, KY

East Palo Alto, CA

Oakland, CA

California

Providence, RI

Oakland, CA

San Diego, CA

California

Fresno, CA

Oxnard, CA

San Francisco, CA

Madison, WI

Santa Cruz, CA

San Diego, CA

St. Paul, MN Sacramento, CA

New York, NY

Oakland, CA Kearny, NJ

San Jose, CA

Berkeley, CA

New York, NY

Austin, TX

Atlanta, GA

Chicago, IL

Springfield, IL

Miami, FL

Los Angeles, CA

Sacramento, CA

San Francisco, CA

Baltimore, MD

Oakland, CA

New Orleans, LA

San Francisco, CA

Bakersfield, CA

San Francisco, CA

San Francisco, CA

El Cerrito, CA

Law Office of Helen Lawrence Oakland, CA Law Office of Peggy J. Bristol Oakland, CA Legal Aid Justice Center Charlottesville, VA Let's Get Free: The Women & Trans Prisoner Defense Committee Pittsburgh, PA Long Beach Immigrant Rights Coalition Long Beach, CA Mariposa Legal Indianapolis, IN Michigan Solidarity Bail Fund Michigan Mujeres Unidas y Activas Oakland, CA National Lawyers Guild - San Francisco Bay Area Chapter San Francisco, CA National Lawyers Guild - Massachusetts Chapter Boston, MA No Detention Centers in Michigan Michigan NorCal Resist Sacramento, CA O.L.A. Raza, Inc. Porterville, CA Open Immigration Legal Services Oakland, CA Operation Restoration New Orleans, LA Pangea Legal Services San Francisco, CA Parole Illinois Chicago, IL Partnership for the Advancement of New Americans (PANA) San Diego, CA Pilgrim United Church of Christ Carlsbad, CA Point Loma Nazarene U., Center for Justice & Reconciliation San Diego, CA Rapid Response Network of Kern County Kern Co., CA Reproductive Justice Inside Baltimore, MD Rev. Joseph L. Muth, Jr. Baltimore, MD Robert F. Kennedy Human Rights Washington, D.C. Root & Rebound Oakland, CA Rural Organizing Project Cottage Grove, OR San Diego Immigrant Rights Consortium San Diego, CA Santa Barbara County Immigrant Legal Defense Center Santa Barbara, CA Services, Immigrant Rights and Education Network (SIREN) San Jose & Fresno, CA Showing Up for Racial Justice (SURJ) National Sikh Family Center San Carlos, CA Sonoma Immigrant Services Sonoma, CA South Bay People Power Chula Vista, CA Southern California Immigration Project San Diego, CA Robert Allen Hood, former warden, Bureau of Prisons The Bortel Firm Minneapolis, MN The Collective Healing And Transformation Project Richmond, CA The Real Cost of Prisons Project Northampton, MA U.C. Berkeley Center for Race & Gender Berkeley, CA U.C. Davis School of Law Aoki Center for Critical Race & Nation Studies Davis, CA U.C. Davis Immigration Law Clinic Davis, CA Unapologetically HERS San Leandro, CA Unitarian Universalist Justice Ministry of California Sacramento, CA Unitarian Universalist Refugee & Immigrant Services & Education Vista, CA

Denver, CO

Baltimore, MD

University of Denver Sturm College of Law Civil Rights Clinic

University of Maryland Carey Law Gender Violence Clinic

University of San Francisco Immigration & Deportation Defense Clinic

ValorUS

VIDA Legal Assistance VIDAS Legal Services

West End P.O.W.E.R.

What's Next Washington

Wild Cat Consulting

Women & Justice Issues

San Francisco, CA Sacramento, CA

Miami, FL

North Bay Area, CA

Pittsburgh, PA Seattle, WA

Clayton, CA

Oakland, CA

cc: Deputy Attorney General Lisa Monaco

Associate Attorney General Vanita Gupta

Assistant Attorney General, Civil Rights Division, Kristen Clarke

Associate Deputy Attorney General, Civil Rights Division, Myesha Braden

Inspector General Michael Horowitz

Assistant Inspector General Sarah Lake

Senator Dick Durbin

Senator Diane Feinstein

Senator Charles Grassley

Senator Jon Ossoff

Senator Alex Padilla

Representative Mark DeSaulnier

Representative Pramila Jayapal

Representative Marilyn Strickland

Representative Eric Swalwell